Principles of International Relations in Commercial Board Games

Lauren Sukin & Luis Rodriguez

Center for International Security and Cooperation Stanford University

March 15, 2022

Today's Goals:

- Understand promises & pitfalls of games
- Explore simple IR concepts in common commercial-off-the-shelf (COTS) games
- Examine more niche COTS games for historical learning, complex scenario-building

Why COTS Games?

Games as Examples:

- Build knowledge base of references for instructors
- Students can explore concepts on their own
- Some games can be used as study tools

Why COTS Games?

Games as Examples:

- Build knowledge base of references for instructors
- Students can explore concepts on their own
- Some games can be used as study tools

Games as Exploration:

- Provide students opportunity to delve into a concept
- Help students visualize and draw connections
- Engage students in immersive learning
- Generate excitement about course material

• Time & Cost: COTS games can be less expensive, easier to plan, and more accessible.

COTS Games vs. Specialized Simulations

- Time & Cost: COTS games can be less expensive, easier to plan, and more accessible.
- Repeatability: Most COTS games can be played over-and-over; simulations are one-off events.

COTS Games vs. Specialized Simulations

- Time & Cost: COTS games can be less expensive, easier to plan, and more accessible.
- Repeatability: Most COTS games can be played over-and-over; simulations are one-off events.
- Focus: COTS games simplify and illustrate a few key dynamics; simulations teach real-world skills and test specific knowledge.

COTS Games vs. Specialized Simulations

- Time & Cost: COTS games can be less expensive, easier to plan, and more accessible.
- Repeatability: Most COTS games can be played over-and-over; simulations are one-off events.
- Focus: COTS games simplify and illustrate a few key dynamics; simulations teach real-world skills and test specific knowledge.
- Fun: COTS games are designed for fun!

• Interactive: Engages students with hands-on learning

- Interactive: Engages students with hands-on learning
- Integrated: Provides opportunities for group learning & individual reflection on course concepts

- Interactive: Engages students with hands-on learning
- Integrated: Provides opportunities for group learning & individual reflection on course concepts
- Illustrative: Offers accessible explanations of complex concepts, especially for visual and kinesthetic learners

- Interactive: Engages students with hands-on learning
- Integrated: Provides opportunities for group learning & individual reflection on course concepts
- Illustrative: Offers accessible explanations of complex concepts, especially for visual and kinesthetic learners
- Imaginative: Helps students understand importance and applications of IR principles

- Interactive: Engages students with hands-on learning
- Integrated: Provides opportunities for group learning & individual reflection on course concepts
- Illustrative: Offers accessible explanations of complex concepts, especially for visual and kinesthetic learners
- Imaginative: Helps students understand importance and applications of IR principles

• Assessment: Evaluate student learning with post-game reflection, iterate in future gameplay

- Assessment: Evaluate student learning with post-game reflection, iterate in future gameplay
- Barriers: Be aware of game's duration, rules, immersion level, accessibility

- Assessment: Evaluate student learning with post-game reflection, iterate in future gameplay
- Barriers: Be aware of game's duration, rules, immersion level, accessibility
- Context: Integrate games into lesson plans, provide historical & theoretical context

- Assessment: Evaluate student learning with post-game reflection, iterate in future gameplay
- Barriers: Be aware of game's duration, rules, immersion level, accessibility
- Context: Integrate games into lesson plans, provide historical & theoretical context
- Design: Manage student expectations with pre-game reflection on game design, recognize play is not reality

- Assessment: Evaluate student learning with post-game reflection, iterate in future gameplay
- Barriers: Be aware of game's duration, rules, immersion level, accessibility
- Context: Integrate games into lesson plans, provide historical & theoretical context
- Design: Manage student expectations with pre-game reflection on game design, recognize play is not reality

Student Feedback on COTS Game Use

- "The activities that I found to be the most helpful and effective were ones in which the students would engage; for instance, the [games] were both entertaining and informative."
- "Interactive activities help us understand how to put theory into real-world examples."
- "She really cared about preparing us and gave us encouragement through games."
- "Interactive activities, such as games, [are] super helpful."

COTS games come in many forms:

- Card games
- Board games

COTS games come in many forms:

- Card games
- Board games
- Online games
 - Many games have versions on Steam
 - Some games have free knockoffs
 - $\bullet \ \ \mathsf{Catan} \to \mathsf{colonists.io}$
 - $\bullet \ \ \mathsf{Diplomacy} \to \mathsf{backstabbr.com}$

Learning the rules:

- With the same game, teach the rules.
- With different games, let each group read the rules.
- With at-home games, use tutorials and videos.

Learning the rules:

- With the same game, teach the rules.
- With different games, let each group read the rules.
- With at-home games, use tutorials and videos.

Two Tips:

- Account for rule-learning time!
- Beginners play differently than experts!

Overview

Teaching with Games

Not-Quite-COTS Games

Simple IPE Concepts

Simple Security Studies Concepts

Complex Immersive Learning

Conclusion

Appendix

Teaching game theory:

- Include simple bargaining models as quick partner games
 - Prisoner's dilemma
 - Stag hunt
 - Market for lemons
 - Tragedy of the commons
 - Bargaining model of war
 - ...and more!

Teaching game theory:

- Include simple bargaining models as quick partner games
 - Prisoner's dilemma
 - Stag hunt
 - Market for lemons
 - Tragedy of the commons
 - Bargaining model of war
 - ...and more!
- Models are easier to understand played than as equations

- Visualize game trees or game dynamics in lecture slides
- Have students bargain (with pennies, candy, poker chips)

- Visualize game trees or game dynamics in lecture slides
- Have students bargain (with pennies, candy, poker chips)
- For small class/e-learning, try playing online:
 - ncase.me/trust
 - economics-games.com
 - moblab.com
 - gametheory.net

Simple Games as Study Tools

- Chronology: For learning dates, connections
 - Create cards with dates & facts

- Chronology: For learning dates, connections
 - Create cards with dates & facts
- Jeopardy: For testing dates & IDs
 - Use jeopardylabs.com

- Chronology: For learning dates, connections
 - Create cards with dates & facts
- Jeopardy: For testing dates & IDs
 - Use jeopardylabs.com
- Taboo/Pictionary/Charades: For IDs & more complex concepts; good for auditory/visual/kinesthetic learners
 - Create a list of terms and concepts

- Chronology: For learning dates, connections
 - Create cards with dates & facts
- Jeopardy: For testing dates & IDs
 - Use jeopardylabs.com
- Taboo/Pictionary/Charades: For IDs & more complex concepts; good for auditory/visual/kinesthetic learners
 - Create a list of terms and concepts
- Codenames: For identifying similarities across concepts
 - Create cards with single terms, use regular 'grid' cards

Overview

Teaching with Games

Not-Quite-COTS Games

Simple IPE Concepts

Simple Security Studies Concepts

Complex Immersive Learning

Conclusion

Appendix

Catan: Rules and Background



• Begin with 2 settlements, 2 roads on hex nodes, edges

Catan: Rules and Background



- Begin with 2 settlements, 2 roads on hex nodes, edges
- Collect resources from hexes adjacent to settlements when hex's assigned number rolled
Catan: Rules and Background



- Begin with 2 settlements, 2 roads on hex nodes, edges
- Collect resources from hexes adjacent to settlements when hex's assigned number rolled
- Use resources to build or to trade with other players

Catan: Rules and Background



- Begin with 2 settlements, 2 roads on hex nodes, edges
- Collect resources from hexes adjacent to settlements when hex's assigned number rolled
- Use resources to build or to trade with other players
- Win by building settlements, upgrading to cities

Catan: Rules and Background



- Begin with 2 settlements, 2 roads on hex nodes, edges
- Collect resources from hexes adjacent to settlements when hex's assigned number rolled
- Use resources to build or to trade with other players
- Win by building settlements, upgrading to cities
- Robber: Roll 7 \rightarrow steal 1 resource, block 1 hex

• Comparative Advantage: Under what conditions is trade beneficial? Why?

Catan: Dynamics of Trade

- Comparative Advantage: Under what conditions is trade beneficial? Why?
- Commitment Problem: Why is it difficult to make trades that involve promises of future actions? How could you make these types of trades easier?

Catan: Dynamics of Trade

- Comparative Advantage: Under what conditions is trade beneficial? Why?
- Commitment Problem: Why is it difficult to make trades that involve promises of future actions? How could you make these types of trades easier?
- MFN: Should you strike a 'deal' with one other player to trade goods at lower costs? Why or why not?

Catan: Dynamics of Trade

- Comparative Advantage: Under what conditions is trade beneficial? Why?
- Commitment Problem: Why is it difficult to make trades that involve promises of future actions? How could you make these types of trades easier?
- MFN: Should you strike a 'deal' with one other player to trade goods at lower costs? Why or why not?
- Institutions: What types of rules or institutions would make trade easier or more efficient?

• Realism: How does the game model anarchy? Is offensive or defensive realism a better strategy?

- Realism: How does the game model anarchy? Is offensive or defensive realism a better strategy?
- Liberalism: What would the game look like if we assumed players would be cooperative rather than competitive?

- Realism: How does the game model anarchy? Is offensive or defensive realism a better strategy?
- Liberalism: What would the game look like if we assumed players would be cooperative rather than competitive?
- Constructivism: What norms do players bring to the game? How do they shape gameplay?

- Realism: How does the game model anarchy? Is offensive or defensive realism a better strategy?
- Liberalism: What would the game look like if we assumed players would be cooperative rather than competitive?
- Constructivism: What norms do players bring to the game? How do they shape gameplay?
- Behavioral Revolution: What biases and assumptions inform players' behavior?

	Desert	Steal
Desert	(0, 0)	(-1.6, 1)
Steal	(1, -1.6)	(-0.6,-0.6)

	Desert	Steal
Desert	(0, 0)	(-1.6, 1)
Steal	(1, -1.6)	(-0.6,-0.6)

Solutions? Side payments, tit-for-tat, grim trigger

	Desert	Steal
Desert	(0, 0)	(-1.6, 1)
Steal	(1, -1.6)	(-0.6,-0.6)

Solutions? Side payments, tit-for-tat, grim trigger Modifications? Longer time horizon, more players

	Desert	Steal
Desert	(0, 0)	(-1.6, 1)
Steal	(1, -1.6)	(-0.6,-0.6)

Solutions? Side payments, tit-for-tat, grim trigger Modifications? Longer time horizon, more players Offense-Defense Dilemma? Balance, distinguishability

From Microcosm to Macroscopic Ideas

- What would happen if players could import items that cannot be created domestically?
- What would happen if there were players on the 'other side' of the ports?
- What (if any) governance system would work best?
- How would military forces change the game?

- Who has agency? Who does not?
- In what historical or intellectual tradition is this game?
- What would the game look like from a different perspective?

Overview

Teaching with Games

Not-Quite-COTS Games

Simple IPE Concepts

Simple Security Studies Concepts

Complex Immersive Learning

Conclusion

Appendix

Root



• Game centers around taking and holding territory

Root



- Game centers around taking and holding territory
- Each player represents a different society, with different capabilities, leadership styles, and goals

Root



- Game centers around taking and holding territory
- Each player represents a different society, with different capabilities, leadership styles, and goals
- Asymmetric game design means players advance at different rates

Root: The Cats & Military Policy

Cats start out in power; they earn points from constructing buildings and must hold a lot of territory to win



Root: The Cats & Military Policy



Cats start out in power; they earn points from constructing buildings and must hold a lot of territory to win

- Monarchy: Must protect castle
- Defensive Advantage: Should consolidate warriors into defensible territory
- Superiority: Should attack invading forces only with an advantage, avoid overstretch
- Civil War: Should stop rebellion early if possible

Root: The Birds & Domestic Politics



Birds earn points by holding territory, destroying buildings

Root: The Birds & Domestic Politics



Birds earn points by holding territory, destroying buildings

- Autocracy: Actions are limited by ruler's decree; decree often forces aggression and expansion
- Audience Costs: Leaders are overthrown and replaced if decree is not fulfilled
- Repression: Birds must quickly repress insurgent forces

Root: The Alliance & Insurgency

The Alliance earn points from spreading sympathy



Root: The Alliance & Insurgency



The Alliance earn points from spreading sympathy

- Subversion: Small military effectively enables expansion
- Recruitment: Players that move through sympathetic territory or destroy defenseless sympathizers cause 'outrage,' aid recruitment
- Commitment Problem: Having allies can be advantageous in the short term, but win condition requires board-wide expansion

Root: The Crows & Terrorism

Crows earn points from 'plots,' including bombs, extortion



Root: The Crows & Terrorism



Crows earn points from 'plots,' including bombs, extortion

- Local Roots: 'Embedded agents' protect plots
- Asymmetry: Plots can be highly effective even against much larger adversary forces
- Victory Elusive: Easier to antagonize than win; difficult to gather forces, yet generally must fight some battles

Root: The Vagabond & Alliance Politics

The Vagabond earns points from exploring, fulfilling quests, and aiding players to build alliances



Root: The Vagabond & Alliance Politics



The Vagabond earns points from exploring, fulfilling quests, and aiding players to build alliances

- Balancing: Vagabond must choose between band-wagoning and power-balancing
- Entanglement: Some vagabonds can 'instigate' conflict between other players
- Entrapment: Once vagabond establishes a sufficiently strong alliance, it can move allied warriors



- Principle of Distinction
 - Outrage



- Principle of Distinction
 - Outrage
- Principle of Proportionality
 - Destruction of civilian objects



- Principle of Distinction
 - Outrage
- Principle of Proportionality
 - Destruction of civilian objects
- Principle of Military Necessity
 - Repression of The Alliance, Vagabond



- Principle of Distinction
 - Outrage
- Principle of Proportionality
 - Destruction of civilian objects
- Principle of Military Necessity
 - Repression of The Alliance, Vagabond
- Principle of Limitation
 - "Brutal Tactics" card



- Principle of Distinction
 - Outrage
- Principle of Proportionality
 - Destruction of civilian objects
- Principle of Military Necessity
 - Repression of The Alliance, Vagabond
- Principle of Limitation
 - "Brutal Tactics" card
- Principle of Humane Treatment
 - Injured cats return to castle


• Play as "Great Powers of Europe" in 1901 (Britain, France, Austria, Germany, Italy, Russia, Ottoman Empire)



- Play as "Great Powers of Europe" in 1901 (Britain, France, Austria, Germany, Italy, Russia, Ottoman Empire)
- Players move armies and fleets, support allied units, or hold positions; battles determined by superior force



- Play as "Great Powers of Europe" in 1901 (Britain, France, Austria, Germany, Italy, Russia, Ottoman Empire)
- Players move armies and fleets, support allied units, or hold positions; battles determined by superior force
- Conduct diplomacy, write orders, resolve orders, retreat/disband, gain/lose units (every other turn)



- Play as "Great Powers of Europe" in 1901 (Britain, France, Austria, Germany, Italy, Russia, Ottoman Empire)
- Players move armies and fleets, support allied units, or hold positions; battles determined by superior force
- Conduct diplomacy, write orders, resolve orders, retreat/disband, gain/lose units (every other turn)

- Domains: Armies, Navies must stay on land, in water respectively (unless ships used to convoy armies)
- Transportation: Can only move to or support forces in adjacent territory, moves can be blocked by enemy forces
- Industrialization: Force size depends on number of supply centers controlled
- Resource Constraints: Forces can only serve one goal at a time (e.g., intended support can be disrupted by attacks)

- Players develop strategy in the diplomacy phase
 - In conversations with all players
 - Or in private groups

- Players develop strategy in the diplomacy phase
 - In conversations with all players
 - Or in private groups
- Strategy determined by geostrategic factors: geography, resources, capabilities...
 - ...and private information, incentives to misrepresent, bluffing, persuasion, and reputation

- Players develop strategy in the diplomacy phase
 - In conversations with all players
 - Or in private groups
- Strategy determined by geostrategic factors: geography, resources, capabilities...
 - ...and private information, incentives to misrepresent, bluffing, persuasion, and reputation
- Tip: It's important to determine other players' goals

Let's Try!



War must be...

- A military necessity
- A last resort
- A proportional response
- Likely to succeed
- Intended for as short of a time as possible

Overview

Teaching with Games

Not-Quite-COTS Games

Simple IPE Concepts

Simple Security Studies Concepts

Complex Immersive Learning

Conclusion

Appendix

- Hex board allows play of 15 different battle scenarios
 - Historical background provided for each battle

- Hex board allows play of 15 different battle scenarios
 - Historical background provided for each battle
- Mimics historical terrain, initial troop placements, and objectives of each army

- Hex board allows play of 15 different battle scenarios
 - Historical background provided for each battle
- Mimics historical terrain, initial troop placements, and objectives of each army
- Game play involves deploying troops, applying unique skills of each unit type, navigating terrain

• U.S. & U.S.S.R. compete across the world throughout the Cold War

- U.S. & U.S.S.R. compete across the world throughout the Cold War
- Players take actions using cards with real-world events:
 - Fidel Castro: Remove all U.S. influence in Cuba
 - NATO: U.S.S.R. can no longer coup in U.S.-controlled European countries
 - Marshall Plan: U.S. adds influence in seven non-U.S.S.R.-controlled Western European countries

- U.S. & U.S.S.R. compete across the world throughout the Cold War
- Players take actions using cards with real-world events:
 - Fidel Castro: Remove all U.S. influence in Cuba
 - NATO: U.S.S.R. can no longer coup in U.S.-controlled European countries
 - Marshall Plan: U.S. adds influence in seven non-U.S.S.R.-controlled Western European countries
- Earn points by influence in battleground (Panama) and non-battleground states (Costa Rica)

- U.S. & U.S.S.R. compete across the world throughout the Cold War
- Players take actions using cards with real-world events:
 - Fidel Castro: Remove all U.S. influence in Cuba
 - NATO: U.S.S.R. can no longer coup in U.S.-controlled European countries
 - Marshall Plan: U.S. adds influence in seven non-U.S.S.R.-controlled Western European countries
- Earn points by influence in battleground (Panama) and non-battleground states (Costa Rica)
- Incorporates space race, DEFCON levels, and alliances

- Offer comparisons to actual historical events
 - Can be especially useful if paired with case studies

- Offer comparisons to actual historical events
 - Can be especially useful if paired with case studies
- Provide more in-depth and more accurate reflections of politics, military strategy

- Offer comparisons to actual historical events
 - Can be especially useful if paired with case studies
- Provide more in-depth and more accurate reflections of politics, military strategy
- Often incorporate multiple IR domains

- Offer comparisons to actual historical events
 - Can be especially useful if paired with case studies
- Provide more in-depth and more accurate reflections of politics, military strategy
- Often incorporate multiple IR domains

Pros:

- Offer comparisons to actual historical events
 - Can be especially useful if paired with case studies
- Provide more in-depth and more accurate reflections of politics, military strategy
- Often incorporate multiple IR domains

Cons:

• Often time-consuming to play and learn

Pros:

- Offer comparisons to actual historical events
 - Can be especially useful if paired with case studies
- Provide more in-depth and more accurate reflections of politics, military strategy
- Often incorporate multiple IR domains

Cons:

- Often time-consuming to play and learn
- Can be harder to synthesize clear lessons
 - Less parsimonious
 - No dominant strategy

Pros:

- Offer comparisons to actual historical events
 - Can be especially useful if paired with case studies
- Provide more in-depth and more accurate reflections of politics, military strategy
- Often incorporate multiple IR domains

Cons:

- Often time-consuming to play and learn
- Can be harder to synthesize clear lessons
 - Less parsimonious
 - No dominant strategy
- Often require deep background knowledge

Overview

Teaching with Games

Not-Quite-COTS Games

Simple IPE Concepts

Simple Security Studies Concepts

Complex Immersive Learning

Conclusion

Appendix

• How does the game you played relate to the principles, concepts, and case studies that we have discussed?

- How does the game you played relate to the principles, concepts, and case studies that we have discussed?
- What principles and incentives shape in-game actions? What assumptions does this game make about political behavior and political institutions? What model of international relations best describes the in-game world?

- How does the game you played relate to the principles, concepts, and case studies that we have discussed?
- What principles and incentives shape in-game actions? What assumptions does this game make about political behavior and political institutions? What model of international relations best describes the in-game world?
- How does the game accurately reflect politics? How could you apply what you observed in-game to the real world?

- How does the game you played relate to the principles, concepts, and case studies that we have discussed?
- What principles and incentives shape in-game actions? What assumptions does this game make about political behavior and political institutions? What model of international relations best describes the in-game world?
- How does the game accurately reflect politics? How could you apply what you observed in-game to the real world?
- How does the game misrepresent politics? How could you modify the game to increase accuracy? What would you expect to happen if you made those modifications?

- How does the game you played relate to the principles, concepts, and case studies that we have discussed?
- What principles and incentives shape in-game actions? What assumptions does this game make about political behavior and political institutions? What model of international relations best describes the in-game world?
- How does the game accurately reflect politics? How could you apply what you observed in-game to the real world?
- How does the game misrepresent politics? How could you modify the game to increase accuracy? What would you expect to happen if you made those modifications?
- How can we use simple models of politics? What are the limitations of those models?

• Interactive learning helps students visualize concepts, generalize lessons, and apply knowledge

- Interactive learning helps students visualize concepts, generalize lessons, and apply knowledge
- Games can be effective teaching and study tools

- Interactive learning helps students visualize concepts, generalize lessons, and apply knowledge
- Games can be effective teaching and study tools
- Simple COTS games can illustrate IR concepts

- Interactive learning helps students visualize concepts, generalize lessons, and apply knowledge
- Games can be effective teaching and study tools
- Simple COTS games can illustrate IR concepts
- Many specialized games build historical knowledge, illustrate more complex military strategy or trade dynamics

Please submit game suggestions and/or guidance for student players here: https://forms.gle/PPdae7kn4nY6kn5x7. (The link is also posted in the chat).

We will host a repository of games and resources on: www.laurensukin.com.

Additional Game Suggestions

- Military Strategy / War Games
 - Stratego, Axis & Allies, Scythe, 7 Wonders, Shogun, The War of the Ring, Risk, 1775 Rebellion, The Shores of Tripoli
- Insurgency / Governance
 - Vietnam 1965-1975, Pax Pamir, Euphoria, Archipelago, Cuba Libre, Labyrinth: War on Terror, Fire in the Lake
- Trade / Economy
 - Wealth of Nations, Oltre Mare, Scythe, Terraforming Mars, Agricola, Container, Imperial Struggle, Polis
- Diplomacy / Negotiation
 - The King is Dead, Oath: Empire & Exile, Twilight Imperium
- Incomplete Information / Bluffing
 - Coup, The Resistance, One Night Ultimate Werewolf, Cosmic Encounter, Secret Hitler
- Cooperation Games
 - Pandemic, CO2, AuZtralia, Spirit Island, Forbidden Island/Forbidden Desert, Eldritch Horror

Further Resources on Gaming & Interactive Learning

- Alridch, C. Learning by Doing: A Comprehensive Guide to Simulations, Computer Games and Pedagogy in e-Learning and Other Educational Experiences.
- Coleman, J. "Learning Through Games."
- De Freitas, S. "Learning in Immersive Worlds: A review of game-based learning."
- De Freitas, S., Savil-Smith, C. & J. Attewell. "Educational Games and Simulations: Case Studies from Adult Learning Practice."
- Huang, A. & D. Levinson. "To Game or Not to Game: Teaching transportation planning with board games."
- Kirriemuir, J. & A. McFarlane. "Literature Review in Games and Learning."
- Pivec, M. and A. Sfiri. "How to Implement a Game in an Educational Context."
- Sanford, R. "Teaching with Games."

- What are some of your favorite COTS games?
- How can these games illustrate IR principles?
- How accurately or inaccurately do these games represent real-world phenomena?
- Would you use COTS in your teaching? Why or why not?

Thank You!

Lauren Sukin Isukin@stanford.edu

Luis Rodriguez jluisrod@stanford.edu

